

גבול האמונה והביטחון Between Faith and Trust

Three lessons on the thin line between unlimited faith in G-d and natural human effort.

•

•

-

The Torah portion Bechukotai begins with the blessings that G-d will shower upon us if we follow His statutes, and continues with the punishments we can expect if we do not. This fundamental issue of Divine Reward and Punishment, a cardinal tenet of our faith, raises many questions for every thinking person. These include:

- 1. How is reward granted? In the form of open miracles, or "camouflaged" as natural phenomena?
- 2. Will every individual be judged and rewarded, or do the rewards and punishments of This World apply only on a national scale?
- 3. Why are some people granted favorable life circumstances, while others do not have the same opportunities?
- 4. What does it mean to have "trust" in G-d?
- 5. How does reward/punishment allow for Free Will?
- 6. How can prayer affect Divine reward and punishment?
- 7. Are we permitted to be cured by doctors, or is this an attempt to circumvent the Divine plan?

We will attempt, in the following series of three lessons, to answer these and other questions related to Reward and Punishment in the Torah.



גבול האמונה והביטחון Between Faith and Trust

Part One

The Land Will Bring Forth its Produce

The sublime concept of Divine reward and punishment for observing or disobeying G-d's precepts appears in many places throughout the Torah. In Parashat Bechukotai it plays a particularly central role:

> אָם בְּחָקֹתַי תַּלֵכוּ... וְנָתַתִּי גִּשְׁמֵיכֶם בְּעִתָּם, וְנָתְנָה הָאָרֶץ יְבוּלָה... If you walk with My statutes... I will bring your rains at their proper time, and your land will bring forth its produce...

ּ וִישַּׁבְתֶּם לְבֶטַח בְּאַרְצְכֶם... וְנָתַתִּי שָׁלוֹם בָּאָרֶץ... וְחֶרֶב לֹא תַעֲבֹר בְּאַרְצְכֶם. and you will dwell securely in your land.... And I will give peace in the land... and no sword will pass through your land. (Vayikra 26,3-6)

One critical aspect of this fundamental principle is that the Torah's promises of reward and punishment are directed at the nation of Israel in its entirety, and not necessarily for the individuals thereof. In addition, the fact that the Land of Israel is repeatedly emphasized in these passages indicates that they are directed at the Nation of Israel living in its Land, and not anywhere else. This point is elucidated by the renowned 13thcentury Torah and Talmud commentator Nachmanides (the Ramban), in his commentary to Vayikra 26,11.

Thus, if the nation's behavior here in the Land of Israel is righteous, we have G-d's clear promise and commitment to provide us with full protection, as well as abundance and blessing in all our endeavors, both spiritual and material, whether naturally or via blatant miracles.

No such obligation or promise, however, is offered to individuals, even when they righteously fulfill the Torah's precepts. In fact, the Ramban's student Rabbi Shlomo ben Aderet, known as the Rashba, noted: "We have seen righteous Sages, such as R. Chanina ben Dosa and R. Elazar ben P'dat, who were terribly poor - even though the entire world existed in their merits" (Responsa, Part I, 1101). This shows clearly that the Torah's promises are not directed at the individual, but at the nation as a whole.

The Torah itself states very clearly that poverty is a perpetual constant in our world, *Olam HaZeh*:

פִּי לֹא יֵחְדַּל אֵבִיוֹן מְקֵרֵב הָאָרֵץ...

The poor will never cease to exist in the land... (D'varim 15,11)

Let us note that the above-mentioned impoverished *tzadikim* did not want to receive handouts or gifts, nor to be supported by others. Given that they did not work for their livelihood, but rather spent all day studying Torah, the only option left for their sustenance was via super-natural miracle. They were exceptions, of course.

The Talmud teaches in the name of Rava (Moed Katan 28a) that the monetary status of any given person is dependent not upon his spiritual merits, but rather upon his "mazal," or his particular "constellation of birth" (a concept that we will explain below). That is, barring miraculous Divine intervention, his future will be determined by factors such as if he happened to be born into a wealthy family.

An Aggadic story in the Talmud states that Hashem answered the indigent R. Elazar ben P'dat along these lines as well:

R. Elazar ben P'dat said he had seen, in a dream, "the Holy One, Blessed be He, sitting by my side, and I asked Him, 'How long will I suffer in this world?'

"And G-d replied, 'Elazar, My son, shall I then turn back the world to its very beginnings and then you might be born in a period of abundance [when your mazal would have been different]?"

No reward is guaranteed for good deeds in This World. Nevertheless, is there any scenario in which a G-d-fearing person will be blessed materially in the merit of his deeds and prayers?

The answer is yes – as long as it occurs in a natural, non-miraculous way. In order to understand this, we must provide an introduction to the fundamental concept of Free Will.

The Freedom to Choose

One of the most important fundamentals in the way G-d runs and supervises the world is the principle of Free Will. The Torah states:

> ראה נתתי לפניך היום את החיים ואת הטוב ואת המות ואת הרע... וּבָחַרָתָּ בַּחַיִּים לְמַעון תִּחְיֵה אַתָּה וְזַרְעֵךָ.

> See I have placed before you today life and the good, and death and the evil... Choose life, in order that you and your descendants may live. (D'varim 30,15-19)

The Torah tells us to choose life. Though this sounds like a command, in actuality it is just good advice – and possibly even a pleading request, as the Torah states earlier:

> מִי יִתֵּן וְהָיָה לְבָבָם זֶה לָהֶם לְיִרְאָה אֹתִי... כָּל הַיְּמִים, למען ייטב להם ולבניהם לעלם.

If only their hearts would remain this way, to fear Me... all the days, so that it might be well with them and with their children forever. (5,26)

And as we similarly read in Psalms:

לו עמי שמע לי ישראל בדרכי יהלכו. Would it be that My people hearken to me, that Israel would walk in My paths. (Tehillim 81,14)

What exactly does this choice entail? What is the "life" that Hashem advises us to choose? The Torah continues a few verses later:

לְאַהַבָּה אֵת ה' אֱ־לֹהֵיךְ לְשִׁמֹעַ בְּקֹלוֹ וּלְדַבְקָה בוֹ כִּי הוּא חַיֵּיךְ וְאֹרֶךְ יַמִידְ... To love Hashem your G-d, to hearken to His voice and to adhere to Him, for He is your life and the duration of your days... (D'varim 30,20) This means that choosing life means choosing G-d: eternal life via clinging to Him.

A paradox arises: How is the balance to be maintained between Free Will and Divine reward and punishment? After all, if one were to be immediately punished for doing something wrong, he would very quickly stop doing it - not because he chooses of his own free will to do good, but because he doesn't like the consequences!

Everyone knows, for instance, that if one touches fire, he will get burned. Should we therefore be "rewarded" for not touching fire? Of course not. Our choice in this case has nothing to do with whether touching fire is ethical or not, but merely with our intelligence in realizing that it is not a smart idea!

G-d cannot allow, therefore, a clear connection between one's actions and the reward or punishment. This explains why the Torah does not promise obvious and open Divine reward and punishment for our individual actions. The option for true Free Will, without the influence of direct reward or punishment, must be maintained.

However, promises of reward can be made, and fulfilled, to the entire Nation of Israel as a whole, without affecting the Free Will of the individuals thereof. Let us recall that the Nation of Israel spent 40 years in the Desert under super-natural Divine guidance – yet this did not prevent the individuals from sinning time after time!

In addition, when the Children of Israel entered the Promised Land, the story repeated itself. They were surrounded by miracles: the splitting of the Jordan River and its drying-out when it usually should have been overflowing its banks; the fall of the fortified walls surrounding Jericho following the marches and shofar-blasts; and more. Yet all this did not prevent one Achan ben Zavdi, of the tribe of Yehuda, from illegally taking from the captured war-time booty and placing it in his own tent (Yehoshua 7).

These examples prove that immediate reward and punishment for the Nation of Israel in its entirety does not prevent the individual from exercising his freedom of choice. In such cases, he does not make the connection between his own actions and G-d's response.

Accordingly, we can say that there are times that an individual can be rewarded or punished immediately, namely, when this will not directly affect the decisions he makes. That is, there must be no direct and obvious

connection between one's good deeds and the reward he receives, or between his sins and the punishment.

The Ramban makes this point in his commentary on the following verse:

וַעַבַדַתֵּם אֵת ה' אֵ־לֹהֵיכֶם וּבַרַךְ אֵת לַחִמְּךְ וָאֵת מֵימֵיךְ, וַהַסְרֹתִי מַחֲלָה מִקּרָבֵּדְ.

If you serve Hashem your G-d, He will bless your bread and water [with abundance] and will remove disease from your midst. (Sh'mot 23,25)

The promised reward in this case does not come via open miracles, but is rather "concealed" within nature – and is promised not only to the Nation as a whole, but even to righteous individuals. That is to say, one who serves G-d with faith, and who utilizes his talents for work or business, will be blessed by G-d in a "natural" manner and will see blessing in his endeavors. People will then assume that he is being rewarded because of his industriousness and talents, and not necessarily because of his spirituality - and thus, the principle of Free Choice is maintained.

In All That You Do

Our thoughts thus far lead us to this conclusion: The way to bring out G-d's blessing in a given field of life is by engaging in that sphere.

For instance, a righteous man who works in agriculture can merit G-d's blessing in his fields and harvest. One who engages in business and commerce will be blessed by G-d in his business dealings. An artist will merit special inspiration that will open gates of creativity for him. And it goes without saying that Torah scholars will find blessing and success in their study and insights - though the gates of financial prosperity will not necessarily open for him.

The following Medrash emphasizes and strengthens this point:

It was taught in Eliyahu's academy [i.e., in his name]:

I was once traveling from place, and I encountered a man who knew the Bible, but did not know Mishna. He said to me, 'Rabbi, I want to say something to you, but I fear that you may be upset.' I said to him, 'Heaven forbid - if your question concerns words of Torah.'

He asked, 'Rabbi, why is it that the Bible says that G-d will "give bread to all flesh" (Psalms 136,25) and also "give the animals their food" (147,9)? Is it not true that man must prepare his own bread?'

I answered him, 'This is the way of the world: Man takes action, and G-d blesses his endeavors, as is written, "So that G-d will bless all your endeavors..." (D'varim 14,29). But lest you think that you need not work at all and can sit and do nothing, the verse concludes, "that you do."

... Take an example from a fool: Because of his lack of wisdom, he cannot support himself at all - and so too, people in general: When their wisdom is taken from them, they are like animals to whom Hashem must distribute food. (Medrash Tehillim 136)

The message here is a sharp one: Someone who expects G-d to provide him with sustenance, yet doesn't lift a finger on his own behalf, is like one who wants G-d to remove his intellect and ability to think, so that G-d will provide him with food like an animal!

G-d's Conduit

Let us study once again the verse quoted in the above Medrash:

וּבַא הַלֵּוִי כִּי אֵין לוֹ חֵלֶק וְנַחַלָּה עִמְּדְ, וָהַגֵּר וְהַיָּתוֹם וְהָאַלְמָנָה אֲשֵׁר בִּשִּׁעַרִידְ, וְאָכְלוּ וְשַּבְעוּ, לְמַעַן יִבָּרַכָּהָ ה' אֱ־לֹהֵיךָ בְּכָל מַעֲשֶׁה יַדְדָּ אֲשֶׁר תַּעֲשֶׁה.

And the Levite who has no share in the Land with you, and the stranger, orphan and widow, will come to you and eat with you and be satiated, in order that G-d will bless you in everything that you do. (D'varim 14,29)

It may sound as if G-d is promising to bless and reward those who help the needy Levites and orphans - but this is not the case. The true meaning of this verse is that if you share with those who need, Hashem will bless you with abundance in order that you have what to give! That is, you will become G-d's conduit, or His emissary, in distributing charity to the needy.

This is how we must understand the following verse as well:

בִּי יִהְיֶה בְּדָּ אֶבְיוֹן... נְתוֹן תִּתֵּן לוֹ, וְלֹא יֵרַע לְבָבְדְּ בְּתִתְּדְּ לוֹ, כִּי בִּגְלַל הַדְּבְר הַזֶּה יְבָרָבְּדּ ה' אֱ־לֹהֶידְּ בְּכָל מַצְשֶׁדְּ וּבְכל מִשְׁלַח יָדֶךְּ.

When there is a poor person among you... Give him charity and do not feel bad about giving, because for this thing G-d will bless you in all your endeavors. (D'varim 15,7-10)

Once again: If G-d sees that you give happily to the poor, He will bless you so that you will be able to continue to give. G-d will essentially appoint you as His agent, and will deposit the poor person's share of wealth with you so that you may give it to him. The reward that G-d is giving you is not really yours, but rather belongs to the poor person.

Again, we see that G-d sends His blessing via nature, so that it will not be directly attributed to one's good deeds, and thus the principle of Free Choice can be maintained.

This raises the following question: How should we divide our efforts? How much should we depend on our own efforts, and how much should we rely on faith and trust in G-d? The answer is given in the Gemara.

R. Yishmael and R. Shimon

In Tractate B'rachot, page 35b, we read the following famous dispute between two great Tannaim (Mishnaic-era Sages):

R. Yishmael cited this verse: "Do not to allow the Torah to leave your mouth" (Yehoshua 1,8). He asked, "Is this to be understood literally? After all, the Torah also states [as we recite in Kriat Shma], 'you will [merit to] gather your grain' (D'varim 11,4), indicating that we are to work!" He therefore explained that one must conduct himself with derekh eretz, as the custom of the land [and work regularly].

R. Shimon bar Yochai disagreed, saying, "Can it be that a man will plow when it is time to plow, harvest when it is time to harvest, and the like? If so, what will become of the Torah and when will he have time to study it?! Rather, when Israel follows G-d's will, their work is done for them by others, as is written, 'Strangers will stand and graze your flock' (Yeshayahu 61,5). But when Israel does not follow G-d's will, they will have to do their work themselves, as is written, 'you will gather your grain' (D'varim 11,14). Not only that, but they will have to do the work of others as well, as is written, 'you will serve your enemies' (28,48)."

Abaye said, "Many did as R. Yishmael said, and they succeeded, and many did as R. Shimon bar Yochai said, and they did not succeed."

Let us delve into this fascinating dispute by returning to its sources. One of the verses cited by R. Yishmael is from the second paragraph of Kriat Shma, V'hayah im Shamoa, which tells us that our reward for adhering to G-d's word will be the privilege of "gathering our grain." This promise includes two good tidings:

- 1. Hashem the King and master of the world gives us ownership over the grain.
- 2. Hashem will enable us to gather and harvest the produce for which we toiled.

We can hone our understanding of these two points via the following two verses that present the opposite scenario, namely, what happens when Israel turns its back upon the Torah:

לַכֶן אָשׁוּב וַלָּקַחְתִּי דְגָנִי בִּעִתּוֹ... *I will therefore return and take My grain in its time...* (Hoshea 2,11) זַרַע רַב תּוֹצִיא הַשַּׁדָה, וּמְעַט תָּאֱסף כִּי יַחְסְלֵנוּ הַאַרְבָּה. The fields will produce much seed, but you will gather little, because the locusts will consume it. (D'varim 28,38)

The curses of these verses contrast with the promises mentioned earlier: The first verse tells us that it is G-d's grain; we do *not* receive ownership of it. The second verse emphasizes that we will not gather much of what we worked for.

Another point to be learned from the Kriat Shma phrase "you will gather your grain" is that our labor is important, even critical. We must engage in these physical tasks, and not indulge in false illusions that bread will miraculously sprout up on our table, or that money will grow on trees for us.

But then how are we to incorporate the command to continually engage in studying Torah? As R. Yishmael noted, G-d specifically told Yehoshua bin Nun as he was about to lead Israel into the Land of Israel:

> לֹא יָמוּשׁ קַפֶּר הַתּוֹרָה הַזֵּה מְפִּיךְ וְהָגִיתַ בּוֹ יוֹמֶם וַלַיִּלָה... Let not this Torah leave your mouth, and you shall engage in it day and night... (Joshua 1,8)

How can we busy ourselves in earthly activities and also be immersed in Torah? R. Yishmael has the answer: "Do so with *Derekh Eretz*, integrating Torah with physical efforts to earn a living." That is, we must engage in Torah not all "day and night," but rather at regular times during both "day and night." But he does not give us the exact proportions by which we must divide our time between work and Torah.

The second Sage in this dispute, R. Shimon bar Yochai, apparently accepts the premise that work must be done, but asks a very natural question: "If one is to carry out all the necessary work for the crops, when will he have time to learn Torah seriously?" He therefore proposes that we follow G-d's will, in which case, "others will stand and will graze your flock." (Yeshayahu

That is to say, the phrase "you will gather your grain." means not that you will be the one to gather your grain, but rather that it will be harvested one way or another – either by others, if you merit it, or by your own hard work, if you do not.

The Tribe of Levi

To understand the depth of R. Shimon bar Yochai's teaching, let us quote the above verse from Yeshayahu in full:

> וָעָמְדוֹ זָרִים וְרָעוֹ צאנְכֶם וֹבְנֵי נָכָר אִכָּרֵיכֵם וְכַרְמֵיכֵם. וְאַתֵּם, כֹּהַנֵי ה' תִּקָּרָאוּ מְשָׁרְתֵי אֱ־לֹהֵינוּ יֵאָמֵר לָכֶם... Strangers will stand and will graze your flock, and outsiders will be your farmers and vine-growers. And you will be called Priests of G-d, about whom will be said, "Servers of our G-d." (Yeshayahu 61,5-6)

The Prophet is foreseeing a time at the End of Days when the entire Nation of Israel will be on the level of Priests of G-d, compared with the other nations of the world. This requires elucidation.

According to the Torah's blueprint for Israel's nationhood, the Twelve Tribes of Israel each received parts of the Land of Israel, in which they were to build and plant, settle and blossom. One tribe, however – Levi – did not receive an inheritance in the Land. The Levites had a different function: to serve in the Beit HaMikdash, to study Torah and prophecy, and to teach it to the Children of Israel. The other tribes were commanded to support the Leviim by giving them their terumah and maaser tithes.

Thus is formed a beautiful bond between the Priest, who brings with him the word of G-d and the joy of his holy service in the Beit HaMikdash, and the Israelite wage-earner, who happily supports him with his tithes. This splendid union brings G-d's wondrous blessing to both of them.

R. Shimon bar Yochai's message is as follows: "Why wait for the End of Days? We can reach this level now! All of Israel can be Priests who serve G-d – just as in Yeshayahu's prophecy. The Gentiles in the Land of Israel will then happily serve 'their Priests,' the People of Israel – just as the Israelites serve their Leviim - out of a desire to be close to the People of G-d and receive His blessing."

However, the Talmudic discussion does not end here. Abaye concludes it by saying that it is not so simple to reach the level of which R. Shimon speaks:

Many did as R. Yishmael taught, and were successful. And many did as R. Shimon taught - and were not successful.

In short, the End of Days has not yet arrived.

But R. Shimon's words do have validity for certain unique individuals, yechidei segulah. The renowned Rambam (Maimonides) rules as follows:

"... and not just the Tribe of Levi alone, but every person of the world whose spirit moves him to separate himself and stand before G-d, to serve and know Him, and who walks upright as G-d created him, and who removes the yoke of the many schemes and calculations in which men are generally involved – he becomes sanctified as the Holy of Holies, and G-d will be his lot forever and ever, and he will merit ample sustenance in this world, just as the Cohanim and Leviim merited." (Laws of Shemittah and Yovel, 13,13)

It is fascinating to note that elsewhere in the Gemara, we find the same two Tannaim, R. Yishmael and R. Shimon bar Yochai, explaining the abovequoted verse - "you shall engage in [the Torah] day and night" - but in opposite ways:

R. Yochanan said in the name of R. Shimon bar Yochai: Even if a man reads only Kriat Shma morning and evening, he thereby fulfills the precept of "Let not this Torah leave your mouth, and you shall engage in it day and night..."

Ben Dama, son of R. Yishmael's sister, asked R. Yishmael: "May one such as I, having studied the whole of the Torah, study Greek wisdom?" R. Yishmael read to him the following verse: 'You shall engage in it [the Torah] day and night' - Go and find a time that is neither day nor night, and you may learn then Greek wisdom."

R. Shimon thus reduces the scope of the obligation to learn Torah, while R. Yishmael amplifies it – contrary to their respective positions in the above passage in Tractate B'rachot! This tells us that they do not actually differ with each other; the two of them together emphasize that there are two different approaches in the service of G-d – and both are desirable as long as they stem from the desire to come close to Hashem.

These thoughts will help us answer the question we posed above regarding the majority of people, those who work for their livelihood: What should be the proper proportion between the time spent on Torah and the time invested in work?

Primary and Secondary

The above-quoted passage in Tractate B'rachot (p. 35b) continues:

R. Yochanan said: Come and see how the later generations are so unlike the earlier generations. The earlier generations made their Torah the main part of their day, and their work transient - and they saw blessing in both. But the later generations made their work the important thing, while Torah was secondary - and saw blessing in neither of them.

The Gemara thus gives us the answer to our question of proportions, and provides us with the exact recipe. It is simply a question of, "What is important in life?"

If one's main goal in life is to know and understand the path set out for us by Hashem, to study His Torah, and to fulfill His commandments then when one works for his living, it is merely as a means to serve this sacred objective. This was how the "earlier generations" behaved, and G-d rewarded them with blessing in both the ends and the means.

But the "later generations" had a different set of goals: Comfortable daily lives and impressive jobs. Coming close to G-d, studying His Torah, and trying to understand His will were secondary objectives, something they did in order to "fulfill their religious obligations" so that they could then go on to their "main" purpose. They thus missed their chance to fulfill their true mission in the world.

R. Yochanan in the Gemara gives us the precise proportion – and it is different for each person. Given that we are all different in our skills, talents, character, financial wherewithal, family, and more, there is no way to answer the question of proportions, other than simply to determine our priorities. We must answer the question, "What is the main aspect of my life, and what is less important?" – and the result will be how we arrange our day.

To further fine-tune the distinction between our main objectives and the secondary ones, the Gemara goes on to provide a specific example of how the earlier and later generations behaved. As background, let us note that fruits must be tithed only after they are brought into one's home in a normal manner. The Gemara states:

R. Yochanan said: The earlier generations would bring their fruits into their homes by way of the door, thus obligating themselves to give tithes. But the later generations would bring their fruits in through the roof, via courtyards, and the like - all in order to exempt themselves from having to tithe the fruits.

The spotlight is placed here on the various approaches to Torah law. Is it viewed as something to be circumvented by the available legal loopholes, or is it rather the Word of G-d that we wish to fulfill whenever possible and thus be true worshipers of G-d?

Here are two practical examples of how we might apply these two different approaches in our day-to-day lives:

1. Eating bread. If one eats less than a certain amount of bread, the obligation to recite the Grace After Meals afterwards does not apply. There are those who try to make sure to eat less than that amount, in order not to "have to" recite Birkat HaMazon. But there are others who actually try to eat more than they might want, in order to have the opportunity to bless and praise G-d.

The question is whether Birkat HaMazon is viewed as an "obstacle" that one must pass over in order to eat - or is it actually the goal itself? Does he desire only the meal, in which case the Grace is simply a means to that end, or is the recitation of Birkat HaMazon a privilege that cannot be performed unless the required amount is eaten? If the latter, one will be happy to eat in order that he may recite a blessing to Hashem.

2. Buying a mezuzah for a new home. For some, the mezuzah is merely a "payment" to G-d for the right to live in their home - in which case they have no motivation to purchase anything other than the cheapest and most unassuming mezuzah. But others truly desire to have the Name of G-d adorning the entrance to their home and rooms, in order to be

constantly reminded of it. They will jump at the opportunity to buy a mezuzah for their new home, and will certainly look for the nicest one they can find.

As such, when the Gemara spoke of making Torah study the important thing in life, it was not referring to the number of hours we study it each day - but where it stands on our scale of priorities. The Honen HaDaat blessing in the daily Amidah, in which we ask for wisdom to differentiate between that which is important and that which is less so, comes to our aid in this matter: It gives us the chance to ask Hashem to help us truly set apart our primary goals from the secondary objectives. How fortunate we are to have such opportunities.

+ + +